

Heritage Team Response

Date – 12/7/2023

APP/23/00249 and APP/23/00250 – North Street House, 6 North Street, Emsworth

Site

North Street House is located on the corner junction of Havant Road and the High Street, adjacent to the roundabout which separates the High Street from North Street in Emsworth town centre. The site is located within the boundary of the Emsworth Conservation Area and comprises a detached 2 ½ storey building of late C18 construction. The building is Grade II listed, first being listed in 1952. The listing description is as follows:

The listing description is as follows:

‘House, late C18. Stucco, with a tile roof. Symmetrical front (east) of 2 storeys and attic, 3 windows, Hipped roof, with coved and molded plaster eaves. Sashes in reveals. Doorcase with pediment and Doric fluted ½ columns and ½ glazed door. The north side brick wall is bowed, with a sash window’.

The front / principal elevation faces onto North Street. A substantial brick wall extends around the north boundary of the site to a car park at the rear which is accessed from Havant Road. The building itself has had a number of extensions and additions over the years. To the south of the main listed building is a single storey link extension which is attached to the adjacent building. This comprises a 3-storey art deco style development (Central Buildings) with commercial units on the ground floor and residential accommodation on the floors above. The application site was previously in use as the Emsworth Doctor’s surgery however, this is due to relocate hence the proposal to find a new use for the listed building and redevelop part of the site.

Proposal

APP/23/00249 - Proposed conversion of 2.5-storey surgery [Class E(e)] building to hotel (Class C1); replacement of single-storey surgery [Class E(e)] building with two-storey café [Class E(b)].

APP/23/00250 - Listed Building Consent for proposed conversion of 2.5-storey surgery [Class E(e)] building to hotel (Class C1); replacement of single-storey surgery [Class E(e)] building with two-story café [Class E(b)].

Legislative and Policy Context:

When assessing the proposal, the following legislation and policy context is taken in consideration.

Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 ("1990 Act") requires local planning authorities to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building, its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest when considering whether to grant listed building consent.

Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires planning authorities, when considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires planning authorities, when considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a

Conservation Area, to have special regard to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character and appearance of that area.

The need for the decision taker to attach considerable or special weight to the desirability of preserving the setting of listed buildings has been reinforced through two recent high court decisions of: Barnwell Manor Wind Energy Limited vs. East Northamptonshire District Council et al (2014); and North Norfolk District Council vs. DCLG and Mack (2014). The above statute and its subsequent and consistent interpretation in recent high court decision emphasises the need for the policies of the NPPF to be implemented whilst always having regard to the need to give special or greater weight to the preservation of the setting of a listed building.

NPPF

The revised NPPF (July 2021) sets out in Chapter 16, the core principles relating to development affecting Heritage Assets that local planning authorities should consider in making planning decisions in the following paragraphs:

189. Heritage assets range from sites and buildings of local historic value to those of the highest significance, such as World Heritage Sites which are internationally recognised to be of Outstanding Universal Value. These assets are an irreplaceable resource, and should be conserved in a manner appropriate to their significance, so that they can be enjoyed for their contribution to the quality of life of existing and future generations.

194. In determining applications, local planning authorities should require an applicant to describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting. The level of detail should be proportionate to the assets' importance and no more than is sufficient to understand the potential impact of the proposal on their significance. As a minimum the relevant historic environment record should have been consulted and the heritage assets assessed using appropriate expertise where necessary. Where a site on which development is proposed includes, or has the potential to include, heritage assets with archaeological interest, local planning authorities should require developers to submit an appropriate desk-based assessment and, where necessary, a field evaluation.

195. Local planning authorities should identify and assess the particular significance of any heritage asset that may be affected by a proposal (including by development affecting the setting of a heritage asset) taking account of the available evidence and any necessary expertise. They should take this into account when considering the impact of a proposal on a heritage asset, to avoid or minimise any conflict between the heritage asset's conservation and any aspect of the proposal.

196. Where there is evidence of deliberate neglect of, or damage to, a heritage asset, the deteriorated state of the heritage asset should not be taken into account in any decision.

197. In determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of:

- a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;
- b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and
- c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.

199. When considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

200. Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification. Substantial harm to or loss of:

- a) grade II listed buildings, or grade II registered parks or gardens, should be exceptional;
- b) assets of the highest significance, notably scheduled monuments, protected wreck sites, registered battlefields, grade I and II* listed buildings, grade I and II* registered parks and gardens, and World Heritage Sites, should be wholly exceptional.

201. Where a proposed development will lead to substantial harm to (or total loss of significance of) a designated heritage asset, local planning authorities should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or total loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh that harm or loss, or all of the following apply:

- (a) the nature of the heritage asset prevents all reasonable uses of the site; and
- (b) no viable use of the heritage asset itself can be found in the medium term through appropriate marketing that will enable its conservation; and
- (c) conservation by grant-funding or some form of not for profit, charitable or public ownership is demonstrably not possible; and
- (d) the harm or loss is outweighed by the benefit of bringing the site back into use.

202. Where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use.

Local Plan

Local planning policy comprises the adopted Havant Borough Local Plan Core Strategy 2011, along with the Allocations Plan 2014. With regards to local planning policy, the following are relevant:

Policy CS11 of the Core Strategy states that planning permission will be granted for development that:

Protects and where appropriate enhances the borough's statutory and non-statutory heritage designations by appropriately managing development in or adjacent to conservation areas, listed buildings, scheduled ancient monuments, historic parks and gardens, archaeological sites, buildings of local historic or architectural interest.

Policy CP16 (1a) of the Core Strategy states 'Planning permission will be granted for development that is designed to a high standard, which helps to create places where people want to live, work and relax. All development should demonstrate that its design:

Identifies and responds positively to existing features of natural, historic or local character within or close to the proposed development site'.

Policy DM20 of the Allocations Plan states that planning permission will be granted for development proposals that conserves and enhances the historic assets of Havant. It also states that application which affect, or have the potential to affect, heritage assets are expected to provide a Heritage Statement (full requirements of which are set out in the policy wording).

Emsworth Neighbourhood Plan

The Emsworth Neighbourhood Plan has now been adopted and has relevant policies which are applicable to this application:

Policy H1 – Design and Heritage

Policy H2 – Buildings of Local Historic Interest

Assessment

These applications follow previous approvals for a change of use of the main listed building to offices and the erection of a 2-storey building comprising a GF retail unit and a first-floor residential unit in 2020. The scheme has now changed in that the change of use proposed is for a hotel. A two-storey extension is also proposed however, this would be a commercial use on both floors instead of residential at first floor.

Conversion of listed building from doctors' surgery to hotel

Various alterations are proposed including:

Internal:

- Creation of new stud walls to facilitate ensuite bathrooms and doorways where existing partitions are situated.
- Removal of non-original partitions
- Change of layout – rooms 7 and 8 – moving of main wall and creation of two ensuites
- Replacement of dormer windows with like for like single glazed, timber windows
- Installation of secondary glazing to existing historic windows

External:

- Demolition of side and rear single structures
- New stone paving laid to forecourt
- New ramp at rear of building

The proposals for the listed building are broadly the same as the existing 2020 permission. Some room layouts will be altered with new studwork however, some of the more unsympathetic alterations where large openings have been made for the previous medical use, will be reversed and doors reinstated. A first-floor wall will be moved to make way for the ensuite bathrooms in Rooms 7 and 8 which would result in the loss of a set of double doors leading to an existing office space. These wooden doors appear to be historic in character. However, the remaining historic fixtures and fittings (i.e., doors, staircases, skirtings, cornicing, internal chimney stacks etc) are being retained as the proposed use does not require the removal of these.

The existing loft space will be retained, and it is proposed that dormer windows are replaced as these are in poor repair. The proposal is to replace these like for like with timber frames and single glazing. The other existing historic windows are being shown as being retained but with secondary glazing proposed. Unfortunately, the style of secondary glazing proposed is not suitable as it comprises

central opening casement style screen which would detract from the original design on the windows. A condition will be included to request details of a more appropriate style of secondary glazing.

The existing garden to the north of the listed building would be retained and the car parking for the hotel use would be contained within the existing car park. This is welcomed as this would retain the small amount of verdant setting to the listed building.

Whilst a small amount of historic building fabric will be removed, this is balanced against the removal of previous unsympathetic alterations and partitioning. Overall, the impact on the heritage asset, as a result of the proposed change of use, would be negligible. The proposed use would bring the building back into use and protect its longevity for future generations.

Two-storey extension to Central Buildings

- Erection of a two-storey, pitched roof extension to the north flank of Central Buildings, finished in painted white render with a natural slate roof, grey painted timber windows and a traditional style, glazed shop front on the ground floor.
- The use of both floors to be for a sit in café (Class E)
- Frontage enclosed with black metal railings to match the listed building

The proposal for the two-storey building is almost identical to the approved scheme in 2020. It was concluded at that time that this proposed building comprises a high-quality design which complements the traditional style of the listed building and does not detract from its architectural significance or the context of this part of the conservation area. The proposal to enclose the front seating area with matching railings is supported. The building would feature timber framed, grey painted windows and be finished with a white painted render which would be appropriate to the historic context.

Overall, the proposed new building and its use, would not result in harm to the adjacent listed building. The proposal would remove an existing unsympathetic building form and replace with this with a well-designed, high-quality building which would enhance the conservation area. As such, the proposal would meet the test of Section 72 of the TCPA which is to preserve or enhance the character of the conservation area.

Conclusion

In summary, it is considered that the proposals would not be harmful to the significance of the designated heritage asset and would preserve and enhance the special qualities of the conservation area, meeting the tests set out in Sections 66 and 72 of the T&CPA 1990 (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas).

NO OBJECTION subject to the following conditions:

1. Details and / or samples of all new external materials (including railings) to be submitted prior to commencement
2. Details of all new windows and external doors to be provided and agreed prior to above ground construction. Details to include:
 - a) a 1:20 plan, section and elevation shown in relation to the opening into which it is to be set,

- b) full size glazing bar section,
- c) the method of opening and external finishes.

All work shall be carried out in full accordance with such approval and be retained thereafter.

3. Schedule of works detailing the removal of the existing extension and repair to south elevation of listed building to be provided and agreed prior to commencement of development
4. Detailed shopfront design to be provided and agreed including materials and window / door details at 1:20
5. Details of the siting and design of any proposed external meter boxes / metal ducting / flues shall be provided and agreed prior to commencement of development
6. Details of new extract vents for ensuite toilets on the main listed building shall be provided and agreed prior to commencement of development
7. Notwithstanding the plans submitted, details of all new secondary glazing (including method of opening) shall be provided and agreed prior to commencement of development